



Integrated Climate Adaptation and Resiliency Program Technical Advisory Council Special Meeting

Meeting Minutes

January 31, 2022 | Zoom Video Conference | 1:00 PM – 3:00 PM
Public Agenda: https://opr.ca.gov/meetings/tac/2022-01-31/docs/20220131-TAC_Agenda.pdf

Item 1: Welcome and Roll Call

Today, we have an agenda focused on our strategic direction for the year ahead, and recapping our accomplishments for the 2021 Impact Report. This special meeting supplements our first quarterly meeting, which will occur in March and will hopefully return to an in-person format.

Agenda

- Item 1: Welcome & Roll Call
- Item 2: Approval of 2022 Priorities
- Item 3: 2022 Work Plan Discussion
- Item 4: 2021 Impact Report Discussion
- Item 5: 2022 Council Appointments & Meeting Schedule
- Item 6: General Public Comment
- Item 7: Close out

Roll Call

- Present: Jacob Alvarez, Nathan Bengsston, Karalee Browne, Lori Nezhura, Grant Davis, Laura Engeman, Jana Ganion, Jason Greenspan, Amanda Hansen, Nuin-Tara Key, Shereen D'Souza, Son Mohnot, Andrea Ouse, Jonathan Parfrey, Michelle Passero, Linda Helland, Brian Strong, Gloria Walton, John Wentworth, Wilma Wooten
- Not Present: David Loya, Dan McDonald, Darwin Moosavi

Item 2: Approval of 2022 Priorities

Discussion

Sloane Viola:

- Our next item seeks Council approval of priorities for 2022.
- At our December meeting, we re-visited the TAC's priorities from 2020 and discussed whether any additions or changes were necessary. We had a good discussion and are grateful for Council members' feedback.
- Generally, we heard that these priority areas were effective and should continue to guide our work because there weren't any significant gaps.
- Based on the Council's input and our increased roles, Staff have proposed two, minor edits to the priorities. We don't think this changes the substance of the priorities, but rather, promotes better alignment with our statutory direction:
 - The first change proposes renaming "Resilience Metrics and Measurable Outcomes" to "Actionable Research and Resilience Metrics"
 - And the second change proposes renaming "Additional Relevant Projects" to "Additional Special Initiatives"

- These changes are recommended to elevate and better reflect the importance of some of the workstreams within these priorities.
 - Adding “Actionable Research” to the Resilience Metrics priority allows us to include the 5th Climate Assessment in this category. Because the Climate Assessment is an important pillar of the state’s climate strategy, we want to capture it in a priority other than “Additional Projects”.
 - Relatedly, we believe that “Additional Special Initiatives” conveys that those workstreams are more than just side projects. The Adaptation Strategy and Extreme Heat Action Plan, which are nested within this category, have been significant initiatives for the team, and we believe this change will better acknowledge their hard work on these projects.

Nathan Bengtsson: Currently doing my own 2022 visioning process and considering language. Understand wanting to align priorities. These presented buckets still make sense, and I support.

Michelle Passero: Agree with these priority areas. Scoping plan happening this year. Important to have focus on an integrated approach that addresses the scoping report. Want to talk through about how there can be more intentional piece associated with scoping plan.

Nuin-Tara Key: We can talk this through in next agenda item in discussing how we drive on these priorities.

Laura Engeman: On priority 1 (actionable research & resilience metrics) Is actionable research part of building out resilience metrics or is this separate?

Nuin-Tara Key: Looking for actionable research to connect to fifth assessment. Resilience metrics doesn't reflect the full breadth of work that will happen in the assessment. There may be research questions identified thru the assessment on how to better track progress over time. We also have resilience metrics that TAC has been engaged in focused on how we track resilience progress over time. As we look at state's 2021 adaptation strategy update, we have state resilience metrics that are part of strategy for the first time.

Sona Mohnot: Echo support for these priority areas. I know that OPR is tasked with a lot of resilience work over next few years. These category areas seem distinct and align what we (Greenlining) see as well. Decision support tools mapping climate equity and vulnerable communities – want to see how this will be coordinated.

John Wentworth: Priority areas look good. Two quick assumption: 1) take all lands/waters approach; 2) funding/financing looks out more than a year or two. We are in the long game business.

Nuin-Tara Key: Will see near term actions in the work plan. But the lens we are taking are the long term funding/financing needs and how do we built that.

Jason Greenspan: We are functioning as the CDBG-MIT Citizen Advisory Committee. How does that fit into the big bucket of priorities? Is this a short- or long-term priority?

Sloane Viola: This is nested within the building partnerships and leveraging resources priority. The Citizen Advisory Committee is neatly nested in that priority area.

Nuin-Tara Key: Different priorities are nested in particular buckets but they are cross cutting. We definitely will continue to serve as the Citizen Advisory Committee. We need to be responsive to the immediate funding and its implementation. But in long

game, we need to understand what barriers/opportunities because this will not be the final time that we will get this type of federal funding.

Public Comment: None

Action: Approve the ICARP Technical Advisory Council priorities for 2022

Do we have a motion to adopt the proposed 2022 Priorities?

- Brian Strong motions.
- Wilma Wooten seconds.

Vote on ICARP TAC's 2022 Priorities

- Yes (20): Jacob Alvarez, Nathan Bengsston, Karalee Browne, Lori Nezhura, Grant Davis, Laura Engeman, Jana Ganion, Jason Greenspan, Amanda Hansen, Nuin-Tara Key, Shereen D'Souza, Son Mohnot, Andrea Ouse, Jonathan Parfrey, Michelle Passero, Linda Helland, Brian Strong, Gloria Walton, John Wentworth, Wilma Wooten
- No: None (0)

Item 3: Draft 2022 Work Plan

Discussion

Nuin-Tara Key: Our next item is a presentation and discussion on the draft ICARP Workplan for 2022. As we've done previously, our workplan is oriented around our priorities, so any changes we made today will be reflected in the final workplan. Councilmembers, the draft workplan included in the meeting materials reflects the significant growth in the capacity and impact of ICARP, which has occurred thanks to your guidance and leadership. The 2021 Climate Budget provided significant investments and new programs for us, and implementation over the next year is a significant opportunity to deliver on our priorities. Sloane, handing it to you for the presentation.

Sloane Viola:

- I'm going to walk through what staff proposed for inclusion in our programmatic workplan, which is organized under the structure of the Council's priorities. While this presentation is oriented around the priorities, the draft workplan posted online and in your packets includes a quarter-by-quarter breakdown if you'd like to refer to that for a more detailed view. Any feedback we receive today will be reflected in the final version of that document.
- For our Actionable Research and Resilience Metrics Priority area, we will see the conclusion, continuation, or initiation of various workstreams.
 - Building on the Council's leadership and thought partnership on resilience metrics, as we transition into implementation of the Climate Adaptation Strategy and start reporting out on those success metrics, we'll continue to engage the Council for guidance and insight on how this state effort fits into the broader resilience metrics effort led by ICARP.
 - Relatedly, the Resilience Metrics white paper will summarize the year+ of work on resilience metrics with the ICARP TAC and state agencies; provide a draft suite of comprehensive resilience metrics; propose a framework for measuring existing metrics; and outline research priorities.
 - To support implementation of Executive Order N-19-19, we will update the Planning and Investing for a Resilient CA Guidebook to include new climate science and guidance on incorporating adaptation pathways into decision-making frameworks.

- We will establish a Science Advisory Group to support better alignment of state efforts to integrate climate science into resilience planning and policy.
 - Finally, we will begin work on the 5th Climate Change Assessment, a core pillar of the state's climate agenda, in partnership with the Resources Agency, Energy Commission, and Strategic Growth Council. The 5th Assessment will include a first-of-its-kind grant program for tribal research, which we are very excited about.
- In our Decision Support Tools and Guidance Priority Area, we are seeking to equip local governments and stakeholders across the state with the tools and resources they need for climate adaptation planning and implementation. To meet this goal, we are doing the following over the next year:
 - We will prepare or update three plan alignment guides, seek new contracts for the Cal-Adapt and Adaptation Clearinghouse interfaces, and identify opportunities for updates or new resources on the Clearinghouse.
 - We have a lot of ideas about potential new resources and tools for the Clearinghouse, including resources related to housing planning, tribal needs, and partnerships and collaboration.
 - We believe these new resources will be very helpful for our stakeholders, and we are excited to bring them to the Council later in the year.
- Next, to Local Implementation. This year, we will
 - Establish the Wildfire Recovery Peer Learning network for fire-exposed and -impacted communities to share lessons learned and best practices, connect to funding opportunities and technical assistance, and inform policy and program development to better meet needs. This initiative will then be written into a case study that will be available on the Clearinghouse.
 - The Proposition 84 Wildfire Resilience Planning Grants will conclude. We will develop a case study, which will also be hosted on the Clearinghouse, on how grantees incorporated wildfire resilience into their long-term disaster resilience and recovery plans.
 - The Resilience Planning and Insurance Working Group will continue its mission of identifying opportunities for ICARP to support integration of resilience priorities into insurance products. We are currently scoping what type of work product, like a case study or workshop, would be a useful outcome of this effort.
 - And the Community Development and Capacity Building Mitigation Program Citizen Advisory Committee will hold 2-3 additional public meetings in conjunction with the TAC.
- Our Funding and Financing priority includes important programs funded with state and federal dollars.
 - The Regional Resilience Planning and Implementation grants program was created in the 2021 Climate Budget, and will offer competitive grants to scale regional resilience solutions.
 - The Adaptation Planning Grant program, another ICARP grant program created in the 2021 Climate Budget, will offer funding to local, regional, and tribal governments to update their planning documents to meet statutory requirements like SB 379.
 - Finally, our FEMA Cooperative Technical Partners work will enter a new phase. As we close out this year, we are going to take the lessons learned as we initiate our new grant to identify state programs that could be aligned with FEMA funding requirements.
- The Climate Equity and Vulnerable Communities priority continues to be anchored by the Vulnerable Communities Platform, which will have a big year in 2022. We will use 2021 Climate Budget funding to offer a grant solicitation for pilot communities to co-develop the platform, convene community listening sessions and user focus groups to make sure

the platform reflects conditions on the ground, and we are hoping to release version 1.0 for public feedback. In addition to sessions at TAC meetings to solicit input, we welcome TAC members' support and engagement in the stages leading up to the platform's launch, including socializing the pilot communities solicitation and co-hosting listening sessions focused on your communities.

- Finally, we come to our Special Initiatives. This is the priority that gives us the flexibility to respond to urgent, emerging, or time-sensitive opportunities in our workspace. In 2021, ICARP was an active partner to co-coordinate both the Climate Adaptation Strategy and Extreme Heat Action Plan. Both the Climate Adaptation Strategy and Extreme Heat Action Plan will be finalized and published in the coming months, and these digital documents will be linked to the Adaptation Clearinghouse.
- Following today's discussion, we will bring a final version of the Workplan to the Council in March, and include the Workplan in the Impact Report. Thank you for your attention, and I'll turn it back to Nuin-Tara to lead the discussion.

Nuin-Tara Key: I'd first like to note how extensive this workplan is, which truly reflects how ICARP and the TAC have demonstrated their value, and how that value has been recognized through the new programs funded in the 2021 Climate Budget.

Karalee Browne: Would like to be more than an advisory role. Be more hands on in the work products.

Nuin-Tara Key: We would love more partners.

John Wentworth: Tuning into many state webinars. There is a dawning concern that there is a lot of policy reconciliation that needs to start taking place. That could throw wrenches into different work. Wildfire, for example. How do identified items in work plan align with Wildfire and Forest Resilience Task Force? How does that one example parallel state effort align with the work we are doing? Question of alignment is so important.

Nuin-Tara Key: There is a lot of work underway. In this administration we've seen a commitment to resilience. Brings together impact/sector specific action plans. Wildfire and Forest Resilience is one of them. One of the ways over the past year is the climate adaptation strategy update. This update looks at all of the different action plans and sees how to bring them together. We have intentionally focused on that question. Important role that ICARP plays is to be a space, with TAC support, that can bring these conversations together and put together the larger puzzle.

Michelle Passero: Related to John's question. Would like to plant a seed as you think through work plan. You've got new programs. We've been doing roundtable discussions around state to understand barriers to implementation. Makes me think about clearinghouse. If there is a way to show funding source alignment for common activities. Make it easier for applicants/users to understand what funding they can piece together.

Nuin-Tara Key: Absolutely. We recognize the tremendous opportunity with existing funding streams. But need to navigate all of them for our partners. Really appreciate the idea to leverage the clearinghouse as a way to share that information.

Brian Strong: Michelle you raised an idea I have. Local jurisdictions struggling with these ideas. SF is a big jurisdiction and we struggle, so I imagine other ones are as well. Any way to make it easier for low-income communities to access these funds would be valuable. Also – I want to get more information on the science advisory group. What can we expect from that?

Nuin-Tara Key: Science advisory group (not a formal council). Has been identified as need over the years. What we proposed would help better align state agency efforts on how we use climate science and information through guidance and decision making. Right now, we have general alignment, but there are opportunities are greater consistency. Come through the CPUC rulemaking on adaptation identified need in state government for a science advisory group. This recommendation has come through numerous TAC members and state action. Budget has been rollercoaster recent years and were finally able to secure funding for this in the 2021 budget. Scoping opportunities for this science advisory group to be a resource for other state agencies. Connection between TAC and science advisory group needs to be there. But we also bridge research/science and policymaking and facilitate that dialogue.

Andrea Ouse: How can this plan support vulnerable communities with technical assistance? Will any of these funding sources help with actual funding of policy development at the local level, like update to climate action plans that are connected to real capital improvements. Climate Action Plans in smaller communities and vulnerable communities do not have staffing to update their Climate Action Plans. Need really hands on assistance. How can this be addressed?

Nuin-Tara Key: We've been talking about the importance of technical assistance. Will consider as we develop guidelines. One thing we have scaled up is the climate services team. What information can really help local governments? We will look to the TAC. More to come.

Shereen D'Souza: Impressive amount of work in the work plan. At the Strategic Growth Council meeting last week, something similar came up. With \$37 billion in programs over two budgets, there is need for disadvantaged communities have ability to navigate these programs and access. We tee'd up SGC to start process of understanding barriers to accessing funds. Want to highlight this, because what happens in TAC space could provide solution. Also - In looking at Vulnerable Communities Platform, another issue that was daylighted last week were various designations that exist around vulnerable communities, disadvantaged communities, etc. Come together and understand which designations and tools (Cal EnviroScreen vs. VCP) make sense for which programs so that there is not a one size fits all approach. Define best how VCP should be use across and outside of state governments would be very useful.

Michelle Passero: With all of these funding sources, would there be potential for a universal program funding application? This would save so much time for people.

Nuin-Tara Key: Some departments are starting to think of that. Some agencies are looking at that for their own wheelhouse.

Brian Strong: Like a common application. The funders can find the applicants.

Public Comment: None

Action: None

Item 4: 2021 Impact Report Outline

Discussion

Nuin-Tara Key: Our next item is a presentation and discussion on the draft 2021 ICARP Impact Report outline. This is a discussion item; the final report will come before the Council for approval at the March meeting. Sloane will share the presentation now.

Sloane Viola:

- Our previous impact report provided important context-setting on the state's climate response and the role of ICARP. It also included a detailed overview of the foundational work of ICARP, like establishing a state adaptation vision and principles and defining vulnerable communities. The report then laid out the priority areas for the year ahead. This annual report will include information on our recent accomplishments and the work planned for the year ahead.
- We'll open with a very high-level overview of climate change in California, including a description of the recent climate impacts the state has experienced in the past two years. We'll also include information on the state's response through executive orders, legislation, and budget investments, which have also changed since our last report. Finally, we'll emphasize the importance of bringing a climate equity lens to climate strategies.
- The report will then provide background information specific to ICARP and the role it plays in the state's climate efforts. This will include its statutory direction to establish the Technical Advisory Council, maintain the Adaptation Clearinghouse, and implement the CA Climate Change Assessment, in addition to its roles in interagency coordination and providing technical support to local and regional governments.
- The next section of the report will detail ICARP's accomplishments from 2020-2021, organized by our priority areas.
- We had several items related to the Actionable Research and Resilience Metrics priority:
 - For the first time, the Climate Adaptation Strategy will include success metrics to assess implementation progress.
 - These efforts contributed to a broader ICARP effort to develop a white paper on resilience indicators that was guided by the TAC's thought leadership. As discussed earlier, the white paper will be coming out this year.
 - Finally, SB 1320 codified the CA Climate Change Assessment as a responsibility of OPR, in close partnership with the Resources Agency, Energy Commission, and Strategic Growth Council. This was a significant step because codification ensures that this pillar of the state's climate leadership continues regularly into the future
- We also succeeded in delivering new decision support tools and guidance:
 - The Adaptation Planning Guide was incorporated into the Adaptation Clearinghouse, which included a webinar series on how the adaptation planning phases are being used by local governments. This resource is now the most-visited page on the Clearinghouse.
 - We also made several noteworthy updates to the Adaptation Clearinghouse, including the creation of a climate equity page. The ResilientCA Adaptation Planning Map is also a new resource that visualizes the progress of local jurisdictions in adaptation planning. The Adaptation Clearinghouse also saw improved functionalities through an update to keyword search and tag streamlining, and the addition of two tutorials.
 - Finally, ICARP successfully secured funding to create or update three plan alignment guides: one for Flood After Fire, a Wildfire Compass, and the Coastal Compass.
- Our Local Implementation workstreams were also quite active over the past two years:
 - Our work through the Community Planning and Capacity Building Recovery Support Function included extensive stakeholder engagement: we held two recovery roundtable events last Spring, numerous scoping conversations with local jurisdictions to inform the development of the peer learning network, and gave a presentation with CalOES at the Southern California Catastrophic Earthquake Workshop.

- In July 2021, the Proposition 84 Wildfire Resilience and Recovery grants were awarded to support wildfire risk reduction, adaptation planning, local understanding of vulnerable communities, and capacity-building.
- ICARP staff partnered with local governments to present on SB 379, climate resilience planning, plan alignment, and technical assistance for local implementation. This engagement opportunity helped to build awareness of ICARP and the Adaptation Clearinghouse resources. These conversations with municipalities also helped us understand how we can support local planning, which will inform our work on the plan alignment guides.
- The Resilience Planning and Insurance Workgroup developed two primers on planning and insurance to develop foundational knowledge for further conversations among participants with different types of expertise.
- Finally, we executed an MOU with HCD for the Community Development Block Grant Mitigation Program Advisory Committee and hosted three public meetings.
- As you are already aware, 2021 was a successful year for climate funding and financing, especially for ICARP.
 - ICARP has been very successful in securing FEMA dollars. The Cooperative Technical Partners grant has supported efforts to better align state programs with federal disaster relief funding. ICARP has been able to provide technical assistance to and coordinate with other agencies, and this work has resulted in three case studies. We also conducted a user needs assessment for a shovel-ready project database, which provided some important insights.
 - ICARP also secured philanthropic funding through the Hilton Foundation to develop the Vulnerable Communities Platform and further our efforts to support wildfire resilience and recovery planning and implementation efforts. This grant allowed us to increase staff capacity to deliver on these important workstreams.
 - Finally, the 2021 Climate Budget was an important win on the basis of all the work that went in to securing the funding itself. The Council provided tremendous value in helping to understand what local-regional needs are, which informed the state's approach in developing the funding streams.
- Our Climate Equity and Vulnerable Communities work took off with the Vulnerable Communities Platform. Staff conducted an inventory of related work and datasets, established an Interagency Technical Working Group, coordinated with relevant interagency initiatives, and conducted listening sessions with rural and tribal communities. The Interagency Technical Working Group is significant for its unique range of perspectives and expertise on climate vulnerable communities, and demonstrates a "whole of government" approach for this TAC priority. Additionally, the Vulnerable Communities Definition that the TAC approved several years ago was enshrined in statute through SB 1320. This is significant because it sets a standard that will likely be used in future legislation, promoting alignment between legislative efforts and our work.
- Finally, we come to our Special Initiatives, the Climate Adaptation Strategy and the Extreme Heat Action Plan. These initiatives were a big lift for the team and required extensive inter-agency collaboration and public outreach. For the Adaptation Strategy, we conducted a kickoff webinar, 10 regional workshops, tribal listening sessions, and three public comment webinars following the release of the draft strategy at the end of last year. The Extreme Heat Action Plan included four listening sessions prior to the draft release earlier this month.
- Because the previous agenda item detailed our 2022 Workplan, I won't rehash it here, but the report will include a look ahead to what we plan on accomplishing this year.
- And that concludes the presentation; I'll hand it back to Nuin-Tara to lead the discussion and public comment.

Jonathan Parfrey: I hope there is a mechanism to let the legislature and other stakeholders know about the impact report.

Nuin-Tara Key: We do continue to socialize ICARP with the legislature. The report highlights the role that the TAC plays.

Wilma Wooten: When will this impact report be published?

Nuin-Tara Key: It is not yet published.

Sloane Viola: Following today's feedback, we will draft the report and bring it to you at the Q1 meeting in March.

Public Comment

Tom Phillips: How do we submit comments on the extreme heat draft action plan?

Nuin-Tara Key: Please send contact information over to Nikki.

Action: None

Item 5: 2022 Council Appointments and Meeting Schedule

Discussion

Sloane Viola

- We are pleased to announce that we have offered reappointments to our members who reached the end of their two-year terms. If you have not done so already, please respond in writing to me (Sloane.viola@opr.ca.gov) with your decision regarding this appointment offer.
- Council members should have received a memo detailing this year's meeting schedule and expectations regarding a return to in-person meetings.
 - We have another Special Meeting of the Resilience Metrics Workgroup on March 10th at 10am.
 - Our first quarterly meeting will take place on March 25th from 9:30am-4pm, and may take place either in-person or over Zoom. Executive Order N-01-22 extended the provisions of AB 361 to allow public bodies to conduct remote public meetings through March 31st. This gives us the ability to conduct the Q1 meeting over Zoom. However, we and others are keen to return to in-person meetings, and may conduct this meeting in-person in Sacramento. We will keep a close eye on COVID case rates and public health guidance, and keep Council members and the public apprised of the decision well in advance of the meeting.
 - After Q1, we expect in-person meetings to resume. We will hold meetings in different locations throughout the state, and welcome input from Councilmembers on potential meeting locations, site visits, and local issues or initiatives to highlight.

John Wentworth: Will quarterly meetings be in person or on zoom?

Nuin-Tara Key: We are balancing a couple considerations. Hosting virtual meetings increases access. At the same time, for those who were involved in the TAC meetings before COVID, there was an amazing opportunity that hosting the meetings in different parts of the state afforded. Important to get out of Sacramento to understand where

opportunities around the state are in this space. Level of engagement at the community level is challenging to maintain virtually. As we look to scale this work, important to connect with communities.

Andrea Ouse: Would like to advocate for a hybrid approach. Local governments are doing hybrid meetings to provide broader accessibility.

Wilma Wooten: Also advocate for hybrid approach to allow for TAC flexibility.

Jonathan Parfrey: Thinking that John would invite us to Mammoth Lakes.

Public Comment

None.

Action: None

Item 6: General Public Comment

None.

Item 7: Closing

Thank you for participating in this special meeting of the ICARP Technical Advisory Council. We look forward to seeing you again at our first quarterly meeting of 2022 on March 25th.

Meeting Adjourn